



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**

**THURSDAY, OCTOBER 13, 2011
COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD**

PRESENT: David Schmidt, Chair
Len Marcisz, Vice-Chair
Timothy P. Burns, Commissioner
Bob Cook, Commissioner
Earl Eisenhower, Commissioner
DeeJaye Lockwood, Commissioner
Jennifer Smithey, Commissioner

STAFF: Don Meserve, Historic Preservation Officer/City Archaeologist

VISITORS: David Ortega, Tim Smith, Danny Little, Anne Maley, John Berry, Noel Knille

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Schmidt called the Historic Preservation Commission meeting to order at 5:30 p.m.

Roll Call

A formal roll call was conducted confirming members present as stated above.

Public Comment

The architect and owners for the Pink Pony application introduced themselves.

1. Discussion/Amendment/Possible Approval:

- 9/8/11 Special Meeting Minutes

MOTION BY COMMISSIONER BURNS; 2ND BY VICE-CHAIR MARCISZ TO APPROVE THE 9/8/11 MEETING MINUTES AS DRAFTED. THE MOTION WAS APPROVED FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0), WITH COMMISSIONER LOCKWOOD ABSTAINING.

2. Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Pink Pony Restaurant Patio Certificate of Appropriateness, Case 2-HP-2011

Mr. Meserve summarized the staff report, described the applicant's proposal, and stated his recommendation for approval. The wooden canopy has been repaired and the proposed changes seem appropriate since many of the features will be maintained. The recommendation for approval recognizes that the façade changes do not meet all of the guidelines in the approved HP Plan for the Pink Pony but that the changes are appropriate for the intended purposes of creating a patio area and the owner's desire to lighten the interior of the restaurant to make it more inviting.

David Ortega, architect for the applicant spoke on behalf of the owners, Tim Smith and Danny Little, both present. Mr. Ortega related the planned exterior changes to the interior operation of the restaurant and noted that the planters are a maintenance headache and collect trash. He showed an old photo of the prior use and noted that they had larger storefront windows before the Pink Pony alterations. Mr. Ortega said the restaurant looked closed and dark from the street and that the owners want it to be more inviting and for the interior to be more visible, consistent with downtown guidelines for stores and restaurants. Adding the sliding doors to the left and lowering the window sill to the right of the entrance will also make the streetscape more visible to their patrons. The proposed changes are all on their property and do not encroach into the public right-of-way for the sidewalk and street.

Commissioner Eisenhower asked if the columns currently supporting the Pink Pony logos are structural and the architect replied that the wooden columns under the canopy are not structural.

Vice-Chair Marcisz made a motion which he then restated as follows: **TO APPROVE A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PINK PONY RESTAURANT PATIO, CASE #2-HP-2011, ON THE BASIS OF THE FACT THAT THE APPLICATION MEETS GUIDELINES 1, 4 AND 11 IN THE HP PLAN, BUT DOES NOT MEET GUIDELINES 6 AND 8; HOWEVER THE OVERARCHING CONCERN IS THAT THESE GUIDELINES ARE NOT MET BECAUSE THE PROPERTY IS BEING CHANGED TO REFLECT MARKET CHANGE IN THE COMMUNITY.**

Commissioner Eisenhower seconded the motion. Vice-Chair Marcisz noted that one of the principal reasons the Pink Pony was listed on the register was it exemplified adaptation and change over time. This was one reason he asked staff for an old picture of the prior use of the building with less fenestration. He noted the application was an attempt by the owners to adjust their property to the demands of the market today.

Commissioner Smithey asked the applicant if they could move the semicircular walls of the planters out rather than removing half the walls. As an architect with experience with restaurants she does want the business to be successful but feels that the proposed removal of half the walls will eliminate most of the visual impact of the curves. She does not support removing half the planter walls and asked about alternative approaches.

Mr. Ortega noted that moving the walls into the sidewalk towards the street would mean moving them into the public right-of-way. He noted that, long-term, the owners would like to work with the city on changes to the sidewalk and street configuration in front of the restaurant, including the planned curb line, but that would come later and there is no agreement for any encroachment.

Danny Little, owner appreciated the use of the word whimsical by Commissioner Smithey since that was something he particularly liked about the Pink Pony and wanted to maintain.

THE MOTION WAS APPROVED SIX (6) TO ONE (1) WITH COMMISSIONER SMITHEY OPPOSED.

3. Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Discussion with Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation Representatives on the Commission's Proposal to Expand the HP Boundary at Taliesin West and on the Foundation's Plans for Taliesin West

Chair Schmidt introduced the discussion on Taliesin West and invited the CEO and other representatives to come forward. Chair Schmidt sent a letter to the CEO and board on July 9, 2010 expressing the Commission's interest in expanding the HP boundary on the property.

Anne Maley made the introductions. She is the interim CEO for the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation and has been for about 2-1/2 years. John Berry is their attorney and Noel Knille is now their Chief Operating Officer (COO). She noted that this discussion had been delayed some months by her schedule but she appreciated the opportunity for this face-to-face meeting with the Commission. She said the board does not support expanding the HP boundary and this is not the time for a change with the board focused on other priorities like the school, increasing visitation and the major challenges of maintaining and repairing the buildings. No new buildings are planned for the campus and no plans for changes are complete. Ms Maley noted that a strategic plan is being prepared and should be completed in approximately 18 months, after which a master plan would be completed based upon the strategic plan. The board is searching for a permanent CEO now and hopes to have a person selected by January so they can be involved in the strategic plan.

Chair Schmidt described the Commission's interest in finding out if the owner was receptive to the HP boundary increase and that the Commission has been working since 2006 on conceptual changes with some positive progress in the past and frustration on getting feedback lately. The threat of a lawsuit was not appreciated. Neither the city nor the board intends to get into a lawsuit.

Ms. Maley noted that communication needs to be better and that her research shows some mixed messages in recent years so that she recognizes why Commissioners may be feeling frustrated. She appreciated having this discussion to clarify the board's position that it does not support increasing the HP boundary on Taliesin West. Preservation and conservation of the roughly 500 acre property is their mission and they have no plans for growth or development on the campus.

Vice-Chair Marcisz requested that the Commission get a formal statement of intent from the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation, owner of their position that they could then share with City Council. The Commission is charged with identifying and protecting historically significant properties in the community. Knowing the Foundation's plans for the next 18 months will help bring closure.

In response to Commission Cook's questions on why the board is opposed to HP, Ms. Maley said it was a challenge for them to have the Commission telling them how to preserve the land or buildings since they know what to do to preserve the property. There is not a preservation plan for the land or views today but that would be part of the master plan after a strategic plan is done.

Chair Schmidt concluded the discussion by thanking the representatives for coming to the Commission meeting and requesting something in writing stating the board's position. The community is interested in remaining a partner with the Foundation for preserving this significant historic property. Ms. Maley agreed that she will send a letter stating the board's position. No votes were taken on this agenda item.

4. Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Consider McCormick-Stillman Railroad Park and Resources within the Park as a Candidate for Local Register Designation

Commissioner Cook described why he felt the Merci car merits historic recognition as a gift to the people of Arizona from the people of France after World War II. He noted that the 40 x 8 box cars are special cars and the whole park reeks of history. The Commission could consider the park for recognition of the trains, depots, McCormick family, etc.

Mr. Meserve described the background materials he sent to the Commission via email for this discussion. He noted that the park itself was completed in 1974 but that many of the full size and miniature trains as well as the train depots are much older than the park. The collection of trains, buildings and objects within the park could be considered for designation as a district. He noted that train engines and cars are considered structures and that is how the Roald Amundsen Private Pullman Car is listed on the national register. The park is associated with the historic contexts of arts and tourism and Scottsdale as a modern dynamic city. The association of the park with rail transportation and as a theme or amusement park could be described in the designation report rather than the city writing a new historic context just for the railroad park designation.

Mr. Meserve stated that the Merci car is owned by the state of Arizona and that other resources in the park are owned by the city and the Scottsdale Railroad and Mechanical Society. He encouraged the Commission to consider the entire park for potential local recognition since this is also an approach that can recognize Guy Stillman as an important person in the city's history along with Anne and Fowler McCormick. The resources within the park will need to be inventoried and evaluated for historic significance and the owners will need to be consulted before initiation of a potential HP overlay zoning case to recognize its historic significance to the community.

Commissioner discussed resources in the park and the steps required to consider the whole park and the impact that considering the McCormick-Stillman Railroad Park would have on the work program priorities. The optional approaches for designation were considered. The old bunkhouse is currently vacant after the model train exhibits were moved to the new building. The partnership agreement for the park between the city and the society should be obtained for reference.

MOTION BY CHAIRMAN SCHMIDT; 2ND BY COMMISSIONER SMITHEY THAT THE COMMISSION AGREES ON AN APPROACH OF CONSIDERING THE WHOLE PARK AS A CANDIDATE FOR AN HP OVERLAY, THAT THE DIFFERENT TYPES OF HISTORIC RESOURCES (BUILDINGS, STRUCTURES, OBJECTS) WITHIN THE PARK SHOULD BE INVENTORIED AND CONSIDERED FOR THEIR ELIGIBILITY AND SIGNIFICANCE, AND REQUESTS THAT THE HPO BEGIN EXPLORING THIS APPROACH WITH INTERESTED PARTIES (OWNERS OF THE RESOURCES, OTHER CITY STAFF, SCOTTSDALE RAILROAD AND MECHANICAL SOCIETY, PARKS AND RECREATION COMMISSION, ETC.). THE MOTION WAS APPROVED SEVEN (7) TO ONE (1).

5. Report/Discussion: Little Red Schoolhouse Video

Vice-Chair Marcisz suggested postponing his report to a future meeting since the hour was late.

6. Report/Discussion/Possible Direction: HPO Report on Activities, Projects & Upcoming Events

- September 10th Perry Mesa Symposium: Mr. Meserve reported that he and Commissioner Cook attended an interesting one-day symposium on archaeological research within the Agua Fria National Monument, generally located between Black Canyon City and Cortes Junction.

- September 20th Golden Keys HOA Board Meeting: Mr. Meserve stated that the board is in support of being considered for historic district designation and that a neighborhood meeting will be probably be scheduled for sometime in November.
- Update on boards, commissions and consolidation; Council meeting November 1st: There was nothing new to report since the three potentially impacted bodies, including the HPC, have provided feedback for City Council to consider. The hope is that this Commission will remain a separate body but final action by City Council is anticipated November 1, 2011.
- Progress report on Villa Monterey HP Plan and Historic Property Inventory Forms, and requirements/procedures for building permits for historic properties: Mr. Meserve reported that he had completed the needed inventory forms on as-is conditions for one block in Villa Monterey and that it took him roughly 45 minutes per inventory form. This will be a major task for the 758 homes and 13 common tracts in Villa Monterey Units 1-7. Commissioners commented that it sounded like an intern is needed for the HP office. The guidelines for Villa Monterey may be a topic for discussion at the November Commission meeting.
- Villa Monterey Celebration: Mr. Meserve included copies of an invitation in Commissioner's packets to attend a neighborhood celebration on their being listed on the local register.

7. Commissioner Comments and Announcements

No comments.

8. Future Meeting Dates and Agenda Items

The next regular meeting date is on November 10, 2011. Mr. Meserve has not received any certificate applications or HRER project requests to date that would need to be on the agenda.

The meeting adjourned at 7:40 p.m.

Minutes prepared by Don Meserve, HPO